

# GLS State Aid Webinar

---

## CASE REFERENCE

### **Hofner v Macrotron GmbH (C-41/90)**

European Court of Justice (Sixth Chamber)

23 April 1991

Westlaw Case Analysis ..... 18 pages

Status:  Positive or Neutral Judicial Treatment

## Hofner v Macrotron GmbH (C-41/90)

European Court of Justice (Sixth Chamber)

23 April 1991

### Case Analysis

|                        |  |
|------------------------|--|
| <b>Where Reported</b>  | [1991] E.C.R. I-1979; <a href="#">[1993] 4 C.M.L.R. 306</a> ; (1991) 135 S.J.L.B. 54   |
| <b>Case Digest</b>     | <p><b>Subject:</b> European Union</p> <p><b>Keywords:</b> Dominant position; Employment agencies; Germany; Monopolies</p>  |
| <b>Related Cases</b>   | <p><b>Hofner v Macrotron GmbH (C-41/90)</b><br/>[1991] E.C.R. I-1979; AGO</p>  |
| <b>All Cases Cited</b> | <p><b>Ahmed Saeed Flugreisen v Zentrale zur Bekämpfung Unlauteren Wettbewerbs eV (66/86)</b><br/><a href="#">[1989] E.C.R. 803</a>; <a href="#">[1990] 4 C.M.L.R. 102</a>; <a href="#">Times, April 13, 1989</a>; ECJ; 1989-04-11</p> <p><b>Volvo AB v Erik Veng (UK) Ltd (238/87)</b><br/><a href="#">[1988] E.C.R. 6211</a>; <a href="#">[1989] 4 C.M.L.R. 122</a>; <a href="#">Times, November 15, 1988</a>; ECJ; 1988-10-05</p> <p><b>Consorzio Italiano della Componentistica di Ricambio per Autoveicoli v Regie Nationale des Usines Renault (53/87)</b><br/><a href="#">[1988] E.C.R. 6039</a>; <a href="#">[1990] 4 C.M.L.R. 265</a>; <a href="#">[1990] F.S.R. 544</a>; <a href="#">Times, November 15, 1988</a>; ECJ; 1988-10-05</p> <p><b>Van Eycke v ASPA NV (C267/86)</b><br/><a href="#">[1988] E.C.R. 4769</a>; <a href="#">[1990] 4 C.M.L.R. 330</a>; ECJ; 1988-09-21</p> <p><b>Ministere Public v Gauchard (C20/87)</b><br/><a href="#">[1987] E.C.R. 4879</a>; <a href="#">[1989] 2 C.M.L.R. 489</a>; ECJ (1st Chamber); 1987-12-08</p> <p><b>Centre Belge d'Etudes de Marche Tele-Marketing SA (CBEM) v Compagnie Luxembourgeoise de Telediffusion SA (CLT) (311/84)</b><br/><a href="#">[1985] E.C.R. 3261</a>; <a href="#">[1986] 2 C.M.L.R. 558</a>; <a href="#">Times, October 21, 1985</a>; ECJ (5th Chamber); 1985-10-03</p> <p><b>Italy v Commission of the European Communities (C41/83)</b><br/><a href="#">[1985] E.C.R. 873</a>; <a href="#">[1985] 2 C.M.L.R. 368</a>; <a href="#">[1985] F.S.R. 510</a>; ECJ; 1985-03-20</p> <p><b>Ordre des Avocats au Barreau de Paris (Paris Bar Council) v Rechtsanwalt Onno Klopp (107/83)</b><br/><a href="#">[1985] Q.B. 711</a>; <a href="#">[1985] 2 W.L.R. 1058</a>; <a href="#">[1984] E.C.R. 2971</a>; <a href="#">[1985] 1 C.M.L.R. 99</a>; (1985) 82 L.S.G. 2088; (1985) 129 S.J. 347; ECJ;</p> |

1984-07-12

**Luisi v Ministero del Tesoro (286/82)**

[\[1984\] E.C.R. 377](#); [\[1985\] 3 C.M.L.R. 52](#); ECJ; 1984-01-31

**Nederlandsche Banden Industrie Michelin NV v Commission of the European Communities (322/81)**

[\[1983\] E.C.R. 3461](#); [\[1985\] 1 C.M.L.R. 282](#); [\[1985\] F.S.R. 250](#); ECJ; 1983-11-09

**Syndicat National des Fabricants Raffineurs d'Huile de Graissage v Inter-Huiles GIE (172/82)**

[\[1984\] E.C.R. 555](#); [\[1983\] E.C.R. 555](#); [\[1983\] 3 C.M.L.R. 485](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 1983-03-10

**Morson v Netherlands (35/82)**

[\[1982\] E.C.R. 3723](#); [\[1983\] 2 C.M.L.R. 221](#); ECJ; 1982-10-27

**Criminal Proceedings against Webb (279/80)**

[\[1981\] E.C.R. 3305](#); [\[1982\] 1 C.M.L.R. 719](#); ECJ; 1981-12-17

**Oebel, Re (C155/80)**

[\[1981\] E.C.R. 1993](#); [\[1983\] 1 C.M.L.R. 390](#); ECJ; 1981-07-14

**Procureur du Roi v Debauve (52/79)**

[\[1980\] E.C.R. 833](#); [\[1981\] 2 C.M.L.R. 362](#); [\[1981\] F.S.R. 535](#); ECJ; 1980-03-18

**Firma J van dem en Zonen (C185/78 to C204/78)**

[\[1979\] E.C.R. 2345](#); [\[1980\] 1 C.M.L.R. 350](#); ECJ; 1979-07-03

**R. v Saunders (Vera Ann) (C175/78)**

[\[1980\] Q.B. 72](#); [\[1979\] 3 W.L.R. 359](#); [\[1979\] 2 All E.R. 267](#); [\[1979\] E.C.R. 1129](#); [\[1979\] 2 C.M.L.R. 216](#); [\(1979\) 123 S.J. 674](#); ECJ; 1979-03-28

**F Hoffmann La Roche & Co AG v Commission of the European Communities (85/76)**

[\[1979\] E.C.R. 461](#); [\[1979\] 3 C.M.L.R. 211](#); [\[1980\] F.S.R. 13](#); ECJ; 1979-02-13

**Knoors v Secretary of State for Economic Affairs (115/78)**

[\[1979\] E.C.R. 399](#); [\[1979\] 2 C.M.L.R. 357](#); ECJ; 1979-02-07

**Ministere Public and Chambre Syndicale des Agents Artistiques et Impresarii de Belgique Asbl v van Wesemael and Poupaert (110/78)**

[\[1979\] E.C.R. 35](#); [\[1979\] 3 C.M.L.R. 87](#); ECJ; 1979-01-18

**GB-INNO-BM NV v Vereniging van de Kleinhandelaars in Tabak (C13/77)**

[\[1977\] E.C.R. 2115](#); [\[1978\] 1 C.M.L.R. 283](#); ECJ; 1977-11-16

**Ufficio Henry Van Ameyde Srl v Ufficio Centrale Italiano di Assistenza Assicurativa Automobilisti in Circolazione Internazionale (90/76)**

[\[1977\] E.C.R. 1091](#); [\[1978\] R.T.R. 8](#); [\[1977\] 2 C.M.L.R. 478](#); ECJ; 1977-06-09

**Van Binsbergen v Bestuur van de Bedrijfsvereniging voor de Metaalnijverheid (33/74)**

[\[1974\] E.C.R. 1299](#); [\[1975\] 1 C.M.L.R. 298](#); ECJ; 1974-12-03

**Reyners v Belgium (2/74)**

[\[1974\] E.C.R. 631](#); [\[1974\] 2 C.M.L.R. 305](#); ECJ; 1974-06-21

**Italy v Sacchi (155/73)**

[\[1974\] E.C.R. 409](#); [\[1974\] 2 C.M.L.R. 177](#); ECJ; 1974-04-30

**Europemballage Corp v Commission of the European Communities (6/72)**

[\[1973\] E.C.R. 215](#); [\[1973\] C.M.L.R. 199](#); ECJ; 1973-02-21

**Key Cases Citing**

**Applied**

Gosselin Group NV v European Commission (T-208/08)

[\[2011\] E.C.R. II-3639](#); [\[2013\] 4 C.M.L.R. 21](#); GC (8th Chamber); 2011-06-16

Motosykletistiki Omospondia Ellados NPID (MOTOE) v Greece (C-49/07)

[\[2009\] All E.R. \(EC\) 150](#); [\[2008\] E.C.R. I-4863](#); [\[2008\] 5 C.M.L.R. 11](#); [\[2008\] C.E.C. 1068](#); ECJ (Grand Chamber); 2008-07-01

Greek Lignite and Electricity Markets, Re (COMP/38.700)

[\[2009\] 4 C.M.L.R. 11](#); CEC; 2008-03-05

Federacion Espanola de Empresas de Tecnologia Sanitaria (FENIN) v Commission of the European Communities (C-205/03 P)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. I-6295](#); [\[2006\] 5 C.M.L.R. 7](#); ECJ; 2006-07-11

Hemat v Medical Council

[\[2006\] IEHC 187](#); [\[2007\] E.C.C. 12](#); HC (Irl); 2006-04-11

**Followed**

AG2R Prevoyance v Beaudout Pere et Fils Sarl (C-437/09)

[\[2011\] 4 C.M.L.R. 19](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 2011-03-03

Millar & Bryce Ltd v Keeper of the Registers of Scotland

[1997 S.L.T. 1000](#); [1997 G.W.D. 25-1265](#); OH; 1997-05-02

**Considered**

Ministero dell'Economia e delle Finanze v Cassa di Risparmio di Firenze SpA (C-222/04)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. I-289](#); [\[2008\] 1 C.M.L.R. 28](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 2006-01-10

**All Cases Citing**

**Mentioned by**

Schindler Holding Ltd v European Commission (C-501/11 P)

[\[2013\] 5 C.M.L.R. 39](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 2013-07-18

**Mentioned by**

European Commission v Stichting Administratiekantoort Portielje (C-440/11 P)

[\[2013\] 5 C.M.L.R. 37](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2013-07-11

**Mentioned by**

Dimosia Epicheirisi Ilektrismou AE (DEI) v European Commission (T-169/08)

[\[2012\] 5 C.M.L.R. 21](#); GC (6th Chamber); 2012-09-20

**Mentioned by**

Compass-Datenbank GmbH v Austria (C-138/11)

[\[2012\] 5 C.M.L.R. 13](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2012-07-12

**Mentioned by**

Scattolon v Ministero dell'Istruzione, dell'Universita e della Ricerca (C-108/10)

[\[2011\] I.R.L.R. 1020](#); ECJ (Grand Chamber); 2011-09-06

**Applied**

Gosselin Group NV v European Commission (T-208/08)

[\[2011\] E.C.R. II-3639](#); [\[2013\] 4 C.M.L.R. 21](#); GC (8th Chamber); 2011-06-16

**Mentioned by**

European Commission v Germany (C-54/08)

[\[2011\] 3 C.M.L.R. 19](#); ECJ (Grand Chamber); 2011-05-24

**Mentioned by**

AH Willis and Sons Ltd v Office of Fair Trading

[\[2011\] CAT 13](#); [\[2011\] Comp. A.R. 267](#); [Official Transcript](#); CAT; 2011-04-27

**Followed**

AG2R Prevoyance v Beaudout Pere et Fils Sarl (C-437/09)

[\[2011\] 4 C.M.L.R. 19](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 2011-03-03

**Mentioned by**

Humber Oil Terminals Trustee Ltd v Associated British Ports

[\[2011\] EWHC 352 \(Ch\)](#); [\[2011\] U.K.C.L.R. 473](#); [Official Transcript](#); Ch D; 2011-02-24

**Mentioned by**

Padawan SL v Sociedad General de Autores y Editores de Espana (SGAE) (C-467/08)

[\[2011\] E.C.D.R. 1](#); [\[2011\] F.S.R. 17](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2010-10-21

**Mentioned by**

Cooper Tire & Rubber Co Europe Ltd v Shell Chemicals UK Ltd

[\[2010\] EWCA Civ 864](#); [\[2010\] Bus. L.R. 1697](#); [\[2011\] C.P. Rep. 1](#); [\[2010\] 2 C.L.C. 104](#); [\[2010\] U.K.C.L.R. 1277](#); [\(2010\) 160 N.L.J. 1116](#); [Official Transcript](#); CA (Civ Div); 2010-07-23

**Mentioned by**

Internetportal und Marketing GmbH v Schlicht (C-569/08)

[\[2011\] Bus. L.R. 726](#); [\[2010\] E.T.M.R. 48](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 2010-06-03

**Mentioned by**

BAA Ltd v Revenue and Customs Commissioners

[\[2010\] UKFTT 43 \(TC\)](#); [\[2010\] B.V.C. 2168](#); [\[2010\] S.F.T.D. 587](#); [\[2010\] S.T.I. 2153](#); [Official Transcript](#); FTT (Tax); 2010-01-28

**Mentioned by**

Neurendale Ltd (t/a Panda Waste Service) v Dublin City Council

[\[2009\] IEHC 588](#); [\[2010\] E.C.C. 21](#); HC (Irl); 2009-12-21

**Mentioned by**

Presidente del Consiglio dei Ministri v Regione Sardegna (C-169/08)

[\[2010\] All E.R. \(EC\) 1037](#); [\[2009\] E.C.R. I-10821](#); [\[2010\] 2 C.M.L.R. 8](#); [\[2010\] C.E.C. 1085](#); ECJ (Grand Chamber); 2009-11-17

**Mentioned by**

VTB-VAB NV v Total Belgium NV (C-261/07)

[\[2010\] All E.R. \(EC\) 694](#); [\[2009\] E.C.R. I-2949](#); [\[2009\] 3 C.M.L.R. 17](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 2009-04-23

**Mentioned by**

AEPI Elliniki Etaireia pros Proostasian tis Pnevmatikis Idioktisias AE v Commission of the European Communities (C-425/07 P)

[\[2009\] E.C.R. I-3205](#); [\[2009\] 5 C.M.L.R. 2](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2009-04-23

**Mentioned by**

SELEX Sistemi Integrati SpA v Commission of the European Communities (C-113/07 P)

[\[2009\] E.C.R. I-2207](#); [\[2009\] 4 C.M.L.R. 24](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 2009-03-26

**Mentioned by**

Kattner Stahlbau GmbH v Maschinenbau- und Metall-Berufsgenossenschaft (C-350/07)

[\[2009\] E.C.R. I-1513](#); [\[2009\] 2 C.M.L.R. 51](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2009-03-05

**Mentioned by**

Slovakian Law on Hybrid Mail Services, Re (COMP/39.562)

[\[2009\] 4 C.M.L.R. 13](#); CEC; 2008-10-07

**Applied**

Motosykletistiki Omospondia Ellados NPID (MOTOE) v Greece (C-49/07)

[\[2009\] All E.R. \(EC\) 150](#); [\[2008\] E.C.R. I-4863](#); [\[2008\] 5 C.M.L.R. 11](#); [\[2008\] C.E.C. 1068](#); ECJ (Grand Chamber); 2008-07-01

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Doulamis (C-446/05)

[\[2008\] E.C.R. I-1377](#); [\[2008\] 5 C.M.L.R. 4](#); [\[2008\] C.E.C. 798](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 2008-03-13

#### **Applied**

Greek Lignite and Electricity Markets, Re (COMP/38.700)

[\[2009\] 4 C.M.L.R. 11](#); CEC; 2008-03-05

#### **Mentioned by**

Private Barnehagers Landsforbund v EFTA Surveillance Authority (E-5/07)

[\[2008\] 2 C.M.L.R. 29](#); EFTA; 2008-02-21

#### **Mentioned by**

Commission of the European Communities v Ireland (C-532/03)

[\[2007\] E.C.R. I-11353](#); [\[2008\] 2 C.M.L.R. 4](#); ECJ (Grand Chamber); 2007-12-18

#### **Mentioned by**

Competition Authority v O'Regan

[\[2007\] IESC 22](#); [\[2007\] E.C.C. 22](#); Sup Ct (Irl); 2007-05-08

#### **Mentioned by**

Finanzamt Dinslaken v Meindl (C-329/05)

[\[2007\] S.T.C. 314](#); [\[2007\] E.C.R. I-1107](#); [\[2007\] 2 C.M.L.R. 12](#); [\[2007\] C.E.C. 192](#); [\[2007\] S.T.I. 218](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 2007-01-25

#### **Mentioned by**

ITC Innovative Technology Center GmbH v Bundesagentur für Arbeit (C-208/05)

[\[2007\] All E.R. \(EC\) 611](#); [\[2007\] E.C.R. I-181](#); [\[2008\] 1 C.M.L.R. 15](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2007-01-11

#### **Mentioned by**

Confederacion Espanola de Empresarios de Estaciones de Servicio v Compania Espanola de Petroleos SA (C-217/05)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. I-11987](#); [\[2007\] 4 C.M.L.R. 5](#); [\[2007\] C.E.C. 143](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2006-12-14

#### **Mentioned by**

SELEX Sistemi Integrati SpA v Commission of the European Communities (T-155/04)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. II-4797](#); [\[2007\] 4 C.M.L.R. 10](#); CFI (2nd Chamber); 2006-12-12

#### **Mentioned by**

Coöperatieve Verkoop- en Productievereniging van Aardappelmeel en Derivaten Avebe BA v Commission of the European Communities (T-314/01)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. II-3085](#); [\[2007\] 4 C.M.L.R. 1](#); CFI (3rd Chamber); 2006-09-27

## Applied

Federacion Espanola de Empresas de Tecnologia Sanitaria (FENIN) v Commission of the European Communities (C-205/03 P)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. I-6295](#); [\[2006\] 5 C.M.L.R. 7](#); ECJ; 2006-07-11

## Mentioned by

R. (on the application of Watts) v Bedford Primary Care Trust (C-372/04)

[\[2006\] Q.B. 667](#); [\[2006\] 3 W.L.R. 213](#); [\[2006\] All E.R. \(EC\) 835](#); [\[2006\] E.C.R. I-4325](#); [\[2006\] 3 C.M.L.R. 5](#); [\[2006\] C.E.C. 884](#); [\[2006\] 90 B.M.L.R. 150](#); [Times, May 19, 2006](#); ECJ; 2006-05-16

## Applied

Hemat v Medical Council

[\[2006\] IEHC 187](#); [\[2007\] E.C.C. 12](#); HC (Irl); 2006-04-11

## Mentioned by

Servizi Ausiliari Dottori Commercialisti Srl v Calafiori (C-451/03)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. I-2941](#); [\[2006\] 2 C.M.L.R. 45](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber); 2006-03-30

## Mentioned by

Ritter-Coulais v Finanzamt Germersheim (C-152/03)

[\[2006\] All E.R. \(EC\) 613](#); [\[2006\] S.T.C. 1111](#); [\[2006\] E.C.R. I-1711](#); [\[2006\] 2 C.M.L.R. 31](#); [\[2006\] C.E.C. 531](#); [\[2006\] S.T.I. 529](#); ECJ; 2006-02-21

## Considered

Ministero dell'Economia e delle Finanze v Cassa di Risparmio di Firenze SpA (C-222/04)

[\[2006\] E.C.R. I-289](#); [\[2008\] 1 C.M.L.R. 28](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 2006-01-10

## Mentioned by

Dansk Rorindustri A/S v Commission of the European Communities (C-189/02 P)

[\[2005\] E.C.R. I-5425](#); [\[2005\] 5 C.M.L.R. 17](#); ECJ; 2005-06-28

## Mentioned by

Hanner, Re (C438/02)

[\[2005\] 2 C.M.L.R. 42](#); ECJ; 2005-05-31

## Mentioned by

St Paul Dairy Industries NV v Unibel Exser BVBA (C104/03)

[\[2006\] All E.R. \(EC\) 172](#); [\[2005\] E.C.R. I-3481](#); [\[2006\] C.E.C. 870](#); [\[2005\] I.L.Pr. 31](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 2005-04-28

## Mentioned by

Heiser v Finanzamt Innsbruck (C-172/03)

[\[2005\] E.C.R. I-1627](#); [\[2005\] 2 C.M.L.R. 18](#); [\[2005\] C.E.C. 687](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 2005-03-03



**Mentioned by**

Viacom Outdoor Srl v Giotto Immobilier Sarl (C134/03)  
[\[2005\] E.C.R. I-1167](#); [\[2006\] 1 C.M.L.R. 47](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber);  
 2005-02-17

**Mentioned by**

Banque Bruxelles Lambert SA (BBL) v Belgium (C-8/03)  
[\[2004\] S.T.C. 1643](#); [\[2004\] E.C.R. I-10157](#); [\[2005\] 1 C.M.L.R. 13](#);  
[\[2004\] C.E.C. 485](#); [\[2007\] B.T.C. 5132](#); [\[2007\] B.V.C. 101](#); [\[2004\] S.T.I. 2256](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 2004-10-21

**Mentioned by**

AOK Bundesverband v Ichthyol Gesellschaft Cordes (C-264/01)  
[\[2004\] E.C.R. I-2493](#); [\[2004\] 4 C.M.L.R. 22](#); ECJ; 2004-03-16

**Mentioned by**

R. (on the application of Khatun) v Newham LBC  
[\[2004\] EWCA Civ 55](#); [\[2005\] Q.B. 37](#); [\[2004\] 3 W.L.R. 417](#); [\[2004\] Eu. L.R. 628](#); [\[2004\] H.L.R. 29](#); [\[2004\] B.L.G.R. 696](#); [\[2004\] L. & T.R. 18](#); (2004) 148 S.J.L.B. 268; [\[2004\] N.P.C. 28](#); Times, February 27, 2004; Independent, March 4, 2004; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2004-02-24

**Mentioned by**

Alderson v Secretary of State for Trade and Industry  
[\[2003\] EWCA Civ 1767](#); [\[2004\] 1 All E.R. 1148](#); [\[2004\] 1 C.M.L.R. 36](#); [\[2004\] I.C.R. 512](#); [\[2004\] B.L.G.R. 389](#); (2004) 101(3) L.S.G. 33; (2004) 148 S.J.L.B. 112; Times, December 12, 2003; Independent, December 17, 2003; Official Transcript; CA (Civ Div); 2003-12-08

**Mentioned by**

Enirisorse SpA v Ministero delle Finanze (C34/01)  
[\[2003\] E.C.R. I-14243](#); [\[2004\] 1 C.M.L.R. 10](#); ECJ (5th Chamber);  
 2003-11-27

**Mentioned by**

Associacao Nacional de Operadores de Maquinas Recreativas (ANOMAR) v Portugal (C6/01)  
[\[2003\] E.C.R. I-8621](#); [\[2004\] 1 C.M.L.R. 43](#); ECJ (3rd Chamber);  
 2003-09-11

**Mentioned by**

Freskot AE v Elliniko Dimosio (C-355/00)  
[\[2003\] E.C.R. I-5263](#); [\[2003\] 2 C.M.L.R. 30](#); ECJ (5th Chamber);  
 2003-05-22

**Mentioned by**

Federacion Nacional de Empresas de Instrumentacion Cientifica Medica Tecnica y Dental (FENIN) v Commission of the European Communities (T319/99)  
[\[2004\] All E.R. \(EC\) 300](#); [\[2003\] E.C.R. II-357](#); [\[2003\] 5 C.M.L.R. 1](#);  
[\(2003\) 72 B.M.L.R. 128](#); CFI (1st Chamber); 2003-03-04

**Mentioned by**

Aéroports de Paris v Commission of the European Communities (C-82/01 P)

[\[2002\] E.C.R. I-9297](#); [\[2003\] 4 C.M.L.R. 12](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 2002-10-24

**Mentioned by**

BetterCare Group Ltd v Director General of Fair Trading

[\[2002\] CAT 7](#); [\[2002\] Comp. A.R. 299](#); [\[2003\] E.C.C. 40](#); [\(2003\) 6 C.C.L. Rep. 170](#); [\(2003\) 69 B.M.L.R. 102](#); CCAT; 2002-08-01

**Mentioned by**

BetterCare Group Ltd v Director General of Fair Trading (Admissibility of Appeal)

[\[2002\] CAT 6](#); [\[2002\] Comp. A.R. 226](#); [\[2003\] E.C.C. 39](#); CCAT; 2002-03-26

**Mentioned by**

Landsorganisasjonen i Norge v Norsk Kommuneforbund (E8/00)

[\[2002\] 5 C.M.L.R. 5](#); EFTA; 2002-03-22

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Arduino (C-35/99)

[\[2002\] E.C.R. I-1529](#); [\[2002\] 4 C.M.L.R. 25](#); ECJ; 2002-02-19

**Mentioned by**

Cisal di Battistello Venanzio & Co SAS v Istituto Nazionale per l'Assicurazione contro gli Infortuni sul Lavoro (INAIL) (C-218/00)

[\[2002\] E.C.R. I-691](#); [\[2002\] 4 C.M.L.R. 24](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 2002-01-22

**Mentioned by**

Ambulanz Glockner v Landkreis Sudwestpfalz (C475/99)

[\[2001\] E.C.R. I-8089](#); [\[2002\] 4 C.M.L.R. 21](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 2001-10-25

**Mentioned by**

Institute of Independent Insurance Brokers v Director General of Fair Trading

[\[2001\] CAT 4](#); [\[2001\] Comp. A.R. 62](#); [\[2003\] E.C.C. 25](#); [Daily Telegraph, September 25, 2001](#); [Official Transcript](#); CCAT; 2001-09-17

**Mentioned by**

Geraets-Smits v Stichting Ziekenfonds VGZ (C-157/99)

[\[2002\] Q.B. 409](#); [\[2002\] 2 W.L.R. 154](#); [\[2003\] All E.R. \(EC\) 481](#); [\[2001\] E.C.R. I-5473](#); [\[2002\] 2 C.M.L.R. 21](#); [\(2001\) 62 B.M.L.R. 101](#); [Times, September 4, 2001](#); ECJ; 2001-07-12

**Mentioned by**

R. v Secretary of State for the Home Department Ex p. Kaur (Manjit) (C192/99)

[\[2001\] All E.R. \(EC\) 250](#); [\[2001\] E.C.R. I-1237](#); [\[2001\] 2 C.M.L.R. 24](#); [\[2001\] I.N.L.R. 507](#); [Times, March 8, 2001](#); ECJ; 2001-02-20

**Mentioned by**

Aéroports de Paris v Commission of the European Communities (T-128/98)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. II-3929](#); [\[2001\] 4 C.M.L.R. 38](#); CFI (3rd Chamber); 2000-12-12

**Mentioned by**

Mayeur v Association Promotion de l'Information Messine (APIM) (C-175/99)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-7755](#); [\[2002\] 3 C.M.L.R. 22](#); [\[2002\] I.C.R. 1316](#); [\[2000\] I.R.L.R. 783](#); ECJ; 2000-09-26

**Mentioned by**

Van der Woude v Stichting Beatrixoord (C-222/98)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-7111](#); [\[2001\] 4 C.M.L.R. 2](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 2000-09-21

**Mentioned by**

Pavlov v Stichting Pensioenfonds Medische Specialisten (C180/98)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-6451](#); [\[2001\] 4 C.M.L.R. 1](#); ECJ; 2000-09-12

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Carra (C258/98)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-4217](#); [\[2002\] 4 C.M.L.R. 9](#); ECJ (4th Chamber); 2000-06-08

**Mentioned by**

Angonese v Cassa di Risparmio di Bolzano SpA (C-281/98)

[\[2000\] All E.R. \(EC\) 577](#); [\[2000\] E.C.R. I-4139](#); [\[2000\] 2 C.M.L.R. 1120](#); [\[2000\] C.E.C. 374](#); ECJ; 2000-06-06

**Mentioned by**

Entreprenorforeningens Affalds/Miljøsektion (FFAD) v Københavns Kommune (C209/98)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-3743](#); [\[2001\] 2 C.M.L.R. 39](#); [\[2001\] Env. L.R. D4](#); ECJ; 2000-05-23

**Mentioned by**

Lehtonen v Federation Royale Belge des Societes de Basket-Ball ASBL (FRBSB) (C176/96)

[\[2001\] All E.R. \(EC\) 97](#); [\[2000\] E.C.R. I-2681](#); [\[2000\] 3 C.M.L.R. 409](#); [\[2000\] C.E.C. 498](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 2000-04-13

**Mentioned by**

Deliege v Ligue Francophone de Judo et Disciplines Associees ASBL (C51/96 and C191/97)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-2549](#); [\[2002\] 2 C.M.L.R. 65](#); [Times, April 19, 2000](#); ECJ; 2000-04-11

**Mentioned by**

Consiglio Nazionale Degli Spedizionieri Doganali (CNSD) v  
Commission of the European Communities (T-513/93)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. II-1807](#); [\[2000\] 5 C.M.L.R. 614](#); CFI (5th Chamber);  
2000-03-30

**Mentioned by**

Deutsche Post AG v Gesellschaft für Zahlungssysteme mbH  
(C147/97)

[\[2000\] E.C.R. I-825](#); [\[2000\] 4 C.M.L.R. 838](#); [Times, March 15, 2000](#);  
ECJ; 2000-02-10

**Mentioned by**

Jagerskiöld v Gustafsson (C97/98)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-7319](#); [\[2000\] 1 C.M.L.R. 235](#); ECJ (6th Chamber);  
1999-10-21

**Mentioned by**

Maatschappij Drijvende Bokken BV v Stichting Pensioenfonds voor  
de Verdoer- en Havenbedrijven (C-219/97)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-6121](#); [\[2000\] 4 C.M.L.R. 599](#); ECJ; 1999-09-21

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Wijsenbeek, Re (C378/97)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-6207](#); [\[2001\] 2 C.M.L.R. 53](#); [\[2000\] I.N.L.R. 336](#);  
[Times, October 12, 1999](#); ECJ; 1999-09-21

**Mentioned by**

Albany International BV v Stichting Bedrijfspensioenfonds  
Textielindustrie (C-67/96)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-5751](#); [\[2000\] 4 C.M.L.R. 446](#); ECJ; 1999-09-21

**Mentioned by**

Laara v Kihlakunnansyyttaja (Jyväskylä) (C-124/97)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-6067](#); [\[2001\] 2 C.M.L.R. 14](#); [Times, October 20,](#)  
[1999](#); ECJ; 1999-09-21

**Mentioned by**

Brentjens Handelsonderneming BV v Stichting  
Bedrijfspensioenfonds voor de Handel in Bouwmaterialen  
(C-115/97)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-6025](#); [\[2000\] 4 C.M.L.R. 566](#); [\[2001\] I.C.R. 774](#); ECJ;  
1999-09-21

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Becu (C22/98)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-5665](#); [\[2001\] 4 C.M.L.R. 26](#); ECJ; 1999-09-16

**Mentioned by**

Montecatini SpA v Commission of the European Communities  
(C-235/92 P)

[\[1999\] E.C.R. I-4539](#); [\[2001\] 4 C.M.L.R. 18](#); ECJ (6th Chamber);  
1999-07-08

**Mentioned by**

Chemische Afvalstoffen Dusseldorp BV v Minister van Volkshuisvesting, Ruimtelijke Ordening en Milieubeheer (C-203/96)

[\[1999\] All E.R. \(EC\) 25](#); [\[1998\] E.C.R. I-4075](#); [\[1998\] 3 C.M.L.R. 873](#); [\[1999\] Env. L.R. 360](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 1998-06-25

**Mentioned by**

Commission of the European Communities v Italy (C35/96)

[\[1998\] E.C.R. I-3851](#); [\[1998\] 5 C.M.L.R. 889](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 1998-06-18

**Mentioned by**

Corsica Ferries France SA v Gruppo Antichi Ormeggiatori del Porto di Genova Coop arl (C266/96)

[\[1998\] E.C.R. I-3949](#); [\[1998\] 5 C.M.L.R. 402](#); [\[1998\] C.E.C. 697](#); ECJ; 1998-06-18

**Mentioned by**

Lease Plan Luxembourg SA v Belgium (C390/96)

[\[1998\] S.T.C. 628](#); [\[1998\] E.C.R. I-2553](#); [\[1998\] 2 C.M.L.R. 583](#); [\[1999\] C.E.C. 374](#); [\[1998\] B.T.C. 5404](#); [\[1998\] B.V.C. 412](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 1998-05-07

**Mentioned by**

Clean Car Autoservice GmbH v Landeshauptmann von Wien (C-350/96)

[\[1998\] All E.R. \(EC\) 434](#); [\[1998\] E.C.R. I-2521](#); [\[1998\] 2 C.M.L.R. 637](#); [Times, May 13, 1998](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 1998-05-07

**Mentioned by**

Decker v Caisse de Maladie des Employes Privés (C-120/95)

[\[1998\] All E.R. \(E.C.\) 673](#); [\[1998\] E.C.R. I-1831](#); [\[1998\] 2 C.M.L.R. 879](#); [\(1999\) 48 B.M.L.R. 32](#); ECJ; 1998-04-28

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Raso (C-163/96)

[\[1998\] E.C.R. I-533](#); [\[1998\] 4 C.M.L.R. 737](#); [\[1998\] C.E.C. 528](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 1998-02-12

**Mentioned by**

Job Centre Coop arl, Re (C-55/96)

[\[1997\] E.C.R. I-7119](#); [\[1998\] 4 C.M.L.R. 708](#); [\[1998\] C.E.C. 507](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 1997-12-11

**Mentioned by**

Stichting Certificatie Kraanverhuurbedrijf (SCK) v Commission of the European Communities (T213/95)

[\[1997\] E.C.R. II-1739](#); [\[1998\] 4 C.M.L.R. 259](#); [\[1997\] C.E.C. 1324](#); CFI (4th Chamber); 1997-10-22

**Mentioned by**

GT Link A/S v De Danske Statsbaner (DSB) (C242/95)

[\[1997\] E.C.R. I-4449](#); [\[1997\] 5 C.M.L.R. 601](#); [\[1998\] C.E.C. 19](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 1997-07-17

**Mentioned by**

Haahr Petroleum Ltd v Abenra Havn (C-90/94)

[\[1997\] E.C.R. I-4085](#); [\[1998\] 1 C.M.L.R. 771](#); [\[1998\] C.E.C. 68](#); ECJ (6th Chamber); 1997-07-17

**Mentioned by**

Tore Wilhelmsen AS v Kommune (E6/96)

[\[1997\] 3 C.M.L.R. 823](#); EFTA; 1997-06-27

**Mentioned by**

Sodemare SA v Lombardia (C70/95)

[\[1997\] E.C.R. I-3395](#); [\[1997\] 3 C.M.L.R. 591](#); [\[1998\] 4 C.M.L.R. 667](#); [\[1997\] C.E.C. 1128](#); ECJ (1st Chamber); 1997-06-17

**Followed**

Millar & Bryce Ltd v Keeper of the Registers of Scotland

[1997 S.L.T. 1000](#); [1997 G.W.D. 25-1265](#); OH; 1997-05-02

**Mentioned by**

Diego Cali & Figli Srl v Servizi Ecologici Porto di Genova SpA (SEPG) (C343/95)

[\[1997\] E.C.R. I-1547](#); [\[1997\] 5 C.M.L.R. 484](#); [\[1997\] C.E.C. 1183](#); [\[1998\] Env. L.R. 31](#); ECJ; 1997-03-18

**Mentioned by**

Stichting Certificatie Kraanverhuurbedrijf v Commission of the European Communities (T18/96R)

[\[1996\] E.C.R. II-407](#); [\[1996\] 5 C.M.L.R. 307](#); CFI; 1996-06-04

**Mentioned by**

Union Royale Belge des Societes de Football Association (ASBL) v Bosman (C-415/93)

[\[1996\] All E.R. \(EC\) 97](#); [\[1995\] E.C.R. I-4921](#); [\[1996\] 1 C.M.L.R. 645](#); [\[1996\] C.E.C. 38](#); [Times, January 17, 1996](#); ECJ; 1995-12-15

**Mentioned by**

Banchero, Re (C387/93)

[\[1995\] E.C.R. I-4663](#); [\[1996\] 1 C.M.L.R. 829](#); [\[1996\] C.E.C. 417](#); ECJ; 1995-12-14

**Mentioned by**

Van Schijndel v Stichting Pensioenfonds voor Fysiotherapeuten (C-430/93)

[\[1996\] All E.R. \(E.C.\) 259](#); [\[1995\] E.C.R. I-4705](#); [\[1996\] 1 C.M.L.R. 801](#); [\[1996\] C.E.C. 240](#); ECJ; 1995-12-14

**Mentioned by**

Esso Espanola SA v Comunidad Autonoma de Canarias (C134/94)

[\[1995\] E.C.R. I-4223](#); [\[1996\] 5 C.M.L.R. 154](#); ECJ (6th Chamber);

1995-11-30

**Mentioned by**

Federation Francaise des Societes d'Assurance v Ministere de l'Agriculture et de la Peche (C244/94)

[\[1995\] E.C.R. I-4013](#); [\[1996\] 4 C.M.L.R. 536](#); [\[1996\] C.E.C. 480](#); ECJ; 1995-11-16

**Mentioned by**

Alpine Investments BV v Minister van Financien (C-384/93)

[\[1995\] All E.R. \(EC\) 543](#); [\[1995\] E.C.R. I-1141](#); [\[1995\] 2 B.C.L.C. 214](#); [\[1995\] 2 C.M.L.R. 209](#); [Times, June 16, 1995](#); ECJ; 1995-05-10

**Mentioned by**

Radio Telefis Eireann v Commission of the European Communities (C-241/91 P)

[\[1995\] All E.R. \(E.C.\) 416](#); [\[1995\] E.C.R. I-743](#); [\[1995\] 4 C.M.L.R. 718](#); [\[1995\] E.M.L.R. 337](#); [\[1995\] F.S.R. 530](#); [\[1998\] Masons C.L.R. Rep. 58](#); [Times, April 17, 1995](#); [Financial Times, April 11, 1995](#); ECJ; 1995-04-06

**Mentioned by**

Ministere Public v Aubertin (C29/94 - C35/94)

[\[1995\] E.C.R. I-301](#); [\[1996\] 2 C.M.L.R. 1](#); ECJ (4th Chamber); 1995-02-16

**Mentioned by**

Commission of the European Communities v France (C-381/93)

[\[1994\] E.C.R. I-5145](#); [\[1995\] 2 C.M.L.R. 485](#); ECJ; 1994-10-05

**Mentioned by**

Commission of the European Communities v United Kingdom (C-382/92)

[\[1994\] E.C.R. I-2435](#); [\[1995\] 1 C.M.L.R. 345](#); [\[1994\] I.C.R. 664](#); [\[1994\] I.R.L.R. 392](#); [Times, June 27, 1994](#); [Financial Times, June 14, 1994](#); ECJ; 1994-06-08

**Mentioned by**

Banco Exterior de Espana SA v Ayuntamiento de Valencia (C-387/92)

[\[1994\] E.C.R. I-877](#); [\[1994\] 3 C.M.L.R. 473](#); ECJ; 1994-03-15

**Mentioned by**

Hilti AG v Commission of the European Communities (C-53/92 P)

[\[1994\] E.C.R. I-667](#); [\[1994\] 4 C.M.L.R. 614](#); [\[1994\] F.S.R. 760](#); [Financial Times, March 8, 1994](#); ECJ; 1994-03-02

**Mentioned by**

SAT Fluggesellschaft mbH v European Organisation for the Safety of Air Navigation (Eurocontrol) (C-364/92)

[\[1994\] E.C.R. I-43](#); [\[1994\] 5 C.M.L.R. 208](#); [Financial Times, January 25, 1994](#); ECJ; 1994-01-19

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Keck (C-267/91)

[\[1993\] E.C.R. I-6097](#); [\[1995\] 1 C.M.L.R. 101](#); [Times, November 25, 1993](#); [Financial Times, November 30, 1993](#); ECJ; 1993-11-24

**Mentioned by**

Collins v Imtrat Handelsgesellschaft mbH (C-92/92)

[\[1993\] E.C.R. I-5145](#); [\[1993\] 3 C.M.L.R. 773](#); [\[1994\] E.M.L.R. 108](#); [\[1994\] F.S.R. 166](#); [Times, November 19, 1993](#); [Independent, December 6, 1993](#); [Financial Times, October 26, 1993](#); ECJ; 1993-10-20

**Mentioned by**

Criminal Proceedings against Corbeau (C-320/91)

[\[1993\] E.C.R. I-2533](#); [\[1995\] 4 C.M.L.R. 621](#); [Times, July 21, 1993](#); [Independent, September 6, 1993](#); [Financial Times, May 25, 1993](#); ECJ; 1993-05-19

**Mentioned by**

Federacion de Distribuidores Cinematograficos v Spain (C17/92)

[\[1993\] E.C.R. I-2239](#); [\[1994\] E.M.L.R. 153](#); [Financial Times, May 18, 1993](#); ECJ (5th Chamber); 1993-05-04

**Mentioned by**

BPB Industries Plc v Commission of the European Communities (T-65/89)

[\[1993\] E.C.R. II-389](#); [\[1993\] 5 C.M.L.R. 32](#); CFI (2nd Chamber); 1993-04-01

**Mentioned by**

R. v Secretary of State for Health Ex p. Goldstein

[\[1993\] 2 C.M.L.R. 589](#); [\[1993\] 4 Med. L.R. 335](#); [\[1993\] C.O.D. 474](#); [Times, April 5, 1993](#); [Independent, April 27, 1993](#); QBD; 1993-03-30

**Mentioned by**

Dr Sophie Redmond Stichting v Bartol (C-29/91)

[\[1992\] E.C.R. I-3189](#); [\[1994\] 3 C.M.L.R. 265](#); [\[1992\] I.R.L.R. 366](#); ECJ; 1992-05-19

**Mentioned by**

Portugal v Morais (C60/91)

[\[1992\] E.C.R. I-2085](#); [\[1992\] 2 C.M.L.R. 533](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 1992-03-19

**Mentioned by**

Ministerio Fiscal v Brea (C330/90)

[\[1992\] E.C.R. I-323](#); [\[1992\] 2 C.M.L.R. 397](#); ECJ (2nd Chamber); 1992-01-28

**Mentioned by**

Merci Convenzionali Porto di Genova SpA v Siderurgica Gabriella SpA (C179/90)



[\[1991\] E.C.R. I-5889; \[1994\] 4 C.M.L.R. 422](#); ECJ; 1991-12-10

**Mentioned by**

Radio Telefis Eireann v Commission of the European Communities (T-69/89)

[\[1991\] E.C.R. II-485; \[1991\] 4 C.M.L.R. 586; Times, October 21, 1991](#); CFI (2nd Chamber); 1991-07-10

**Mentioned by**

BBC v Commission of the European Communities (T70/89)

[\[1991\] E.C.R. II-535; \[1991\] 4 C.M.L.R. 669](#); CFI (2nd Chamber); 1991-07-10

**Journal Articles**

**Are state owned healthcare providers that are funded by general taxation undertakings subject to competition law?**

Competition; Competition law; EU law; Health care.

[E.C.L.R. 2011, 32\(5\), 231-241](#)

**Buying exclusion in EU competition rules - assessing reasons and consequences**

Abuse of dominant position; Anti-competitive practices; EU law; Economics and law; Exemptions; Procurement.

[Euro. C.J. 2011, 7\(3\), 433-454](#)

**The compulsory licence of intellectual property rights under the EC competition rules: an analysis of the exception to the general rule of ownership immunity from competition rules**

Abuse of dominant position; Compulsory licensing; EU law; Essential facilities; Intellectual property; Refusal to supply; Services of general economic interest.

[Comp. L. Rev. 2009, 6\(1\), 117-137](#)

**Hemat v The Medical Council: the Wouters legacy revisited**

Anti-competitive practices; Codes of conduct; EC law; Ireland; Regulatory bodies; Statutory interpretation.

[E.C.L.R. 2007, 28\(6\), 366-370](#)

**When is an undertaking not an undertaking?**

Competition policy; EC law; Undertakings.

[E.C.L.R. 2004, 25\(7\), 383-385](#)

**Abuse of dominant position (Employment agency): the Hoefner Case.**

Dominant position; EEC law; Employment services; Monopolies; Public authorities.

[Comp. Law E.C. 1991, 14\(7\), 159-161](#)

**Article 90 and service monopolies.**

Broadcasting; Competition law; EEC law; Monopolies.

[U.L.R. 1991, 2\(3\), 114-120](#)

**Books**

**Benjamin's Sale of Goods 8th Ed. Incorporating Second**

**Supplement**

Chapter: Chapter 3 - Application of General Contractual Principles

Documents: [Section 5. - Illegality](#)

**Benjamin's Sale of Goods 8th Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter 3 - Application of General Contractual Principles

Documents: [Section 5. - Illegality](#)

**Chitty on Contracts 31st Ed. Incorporating First Supplement**

Chapter: Chapter 42 - Restrictive Agreements and Competition

Documents: [Sub-section \(b\) - Article 101\(1\)](#)

**Chitty on Contracts 31st Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter 42 - Restrictive Agreements and Competition

Documents: [Sub-section \(b\) - Article 101\(1\)](#)

**Directors' Disqualification & Insolvency Restrictions 3rd Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter 6 - Competition Disqualification Orders

Documents: [Section 2. - Section 9A: Mandatory Disqualification for Unfit Conduct Following a Breach of Competition Law](#)

**EC Merger Control 5th Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter 4 - Community Dimension

Documents: [Section 4. - Undertakings Concerned](#)

**Encyclopedia of Information Technology Law**

Chapter: Chapter 8 - Competition Law

Documents: [8.314 General scope of the prohibition](#)

**International Agency, Distribution and Licensing Agreements 6th Ed. Christou**

Chapter: Chapter 5 - Distribution Agreements Inside the EU

Documents: [Section 5.1 - Commercial and legal background](#)

**Kerse & Khan on EU Antitrust Procedure 6th Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter 1 - EU Competition Rules and their Enforcement

Documents: [Section II. - Articles 101 And 102](#)

**Lindley & Banks on Partnership 19th Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter 8 - Illegal Partnerships

Documents: [Sub-section I. - Competition](#)

**Telecommunications, Broadcasting and the Internet, EU Competition Law and Regulation 3rd Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter V - Market Conduct

Documents: [Sub-section 1. - Article 101: prohibition of anti-competitive agreements, decisions and concerted practices](#)

**Telecommunications, Broadcasting and the Internet, EU  
Competition Law and Regulation 3rd Ed.**

Chapter: Chapter V - Market Conduct

Documents: [Sub-section 1. - Dominance](#)

© 2014 Sweet & Maxwell

